Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, December 17, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Scott Rice (SR); Harriet Behar (HB); Tom Chapman (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD) - observer; Steve Ela (SE)
Absent: A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- December 3 notes
- 2022 Sunsets: Orange shellac (HB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Sodium hydroxide (HB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Colors (18) (TC) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Glycerin (TC) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Turkish bay leaves (SR) - discuss
- Ion exchange draft discussion document
- Thoughts on 205.606 (HB)
- Other
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** December 3 accepted with minor revisions by the Chair.
- **2022 Sunsets: Orange shellac (HB).** The lead summarized the review of orange shellac. A member asked about plasticizers, which another member noted would not be allowed in organic production.
- **2022 Sunsets: Sodium hydroxide (HB).** The lead summarized the review, uses of sodium hydroxide, and the last TR. Sodium hydroxide is annotated on 205.605(b).
- **2022 Sunsets: Colors (18) (TC).** The lead summarized the review, noting manufacturing techniques. The NOSB renewed all colors last time, but also recommended that future Boards take a critical look at each individual color to consider if any are now available in organic form. The group also discussed ancillary substances and barriers to producing organic forms. LD will add some information from commenters submitted during the last review.
- **2022 Sunsets: Glycerin (TC).** The lead summarized the use and manufacture of glycerin, and noted that it was reclassified during the last review.
- **2022 Sunsets: Turkish bay leaves (SR).** The lead summarized the review and noted that the NOSB had previously recommended removal during the last sunset review. The NOP received comments during the proposed rule phase and determined that it should remain on the list. The manufacturer who commented on the proposed rule provided substantive reason for why it should remain on the list. The lead will add information from the comment to this current review.
- **Ion exchange draft discussion document (HB/SE/SR).** HB will transition this work to SE and SR before she rotates off the NOSB in January. Deferred to next call.
- **Thoughts on 205.606 (HB).** Deferred to next call.
- **Other items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

December 3, 2019

- 2022 Sunsets: Kaolin (LD) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Waxes (Wood resin) (LD) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Carnauba wax (LD) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (TC) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (TC) - discuss

December 17, 2019

- 2022 Sunsets: Colors (18) (TC) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Glycerin (TC) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Sodium hydroxide (HB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Orange shellac (HB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Turkish bay leaves (SR) - discuss

January 7, 2020

- 2022 Sunsets: Ozone (SR) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Kelp (ARB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Whey protein concentrate (ARB) - discuss
- Fish oil discussion document (TC)
- Ion exchange draft discussion document (SE/SR) – discuss
- L-Malic acid reclassification
- Research priorities - discuss discussion document
- Thoughts on 205.606 (HB).

January 21, 2020

- 2022 Sunsets: Cornstarch (AB) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Sweet potato starch (AB) – discuss
- Research priorities - discuss discussion document

February 4, 2020
February 18, 2020
March 3, 2020
March 17, 2020
April 7, 2020
April 21, 2020
May 5, 2020
May 19, 2020
June 2, 2020
June 16, 2020
July 7, 2020
July 21, 2020
August 4, 2020
August 18, 2020
September 1, 2020
September 15, 2020
October 6, 2020
October 20, 2020
November 3, 2020
November 17, 2020
December 1, 2020
December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Low acyl gellan gum	205.605	LD/SR	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 9.17.19. Sufficiency due 11.15.19. HS sent additional questions to petitioner 11.7.19	11.5.19 11.19.19	TBD
Red jalapeño pepper	205.606	SE	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 10.8.19. Sufficiency due 12.6.19	11.19.19	TBD

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Fish oil annotation	TC, HB, AB	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. Disc/vote discussion doc 1.7.20	Spr 2020
L-Malic acid reclassification	TC/SR?	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19.	Spr 2020
Ion exchange filtration	SE/SR	NOP memo sent to NOSB 8.27.19. TR requested 9.3.19. TR due in ~ mid-January 2020. Discussion doc Spr 2020.	Spr 2020
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Jan 2020.	Spring 2020
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 1.12.14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11.19.14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9.30.16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10.19.16. TR sufficiency due 12.20.16. TR found insufficient 12.20.16. Vote: 2.21.17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 7.10.17. Response due 09.8.17. TR found sufficient 8.1.17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc On hold
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 1.12.16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (IOE) (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	12.3.19	"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.19	"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	12.17.19	"
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	1.7.19	"
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify	12.3.19	
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY	12.17.19	

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, December 3, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Scott Rice (SR); Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB), observing
Absent: Tom Chapman (TC); A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- November 19 notes
- 2022 Sunsets: Kaolin (LD) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Waxes (Wood resin) (LD) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Carnauba wax (LD) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (TC) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (TC) - discuss
- Fish oil discussion document
- Update - Low acyl gellan gum questions
- Update - Red Jalapeno Pepper petition
- Other
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** November 19 were accepted as is.
- **2022 Sunsets: Kaolin (LD).** The Subcommittee discussed the review and given the sparse info included in the last review, is anticipating feedback from the public. A member noted that kaolin is listed on all the International processing lists. EU, Japan, Codex, IFOAM, and Canada.
- **2022 Sunsets: Waxes (Wood resin) (LD).** The Subcommittee discussed the review and TR, including the spelling of resin, which should read rosin. The NOSB previously recommended a correction, but it hasn't been corrected. The HS added questions to the review for the public comment posting. AB will review solvents mentioned in the TR that are used in the manufacturing process: benzene, ketone solvent, solvent from terpene oil-rosin solutions, proprietary polar solvent, methanol, etc. .
- **2022 Sunsets: Carnauba wax (LD).** Listed at 202.606. Used as a component in fruit coatings and as a processing aid, among other things. I was relisted during the last sunset review from 205.605 to 205.606. Nineteen instances listed in the Organic Integrity Database.
- **2022 Sunsets: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (TC).** Last reviewed at 2015 sunset. Used as leavening agent, most commonly used with sodium bicarbonate to make baking powder. Listed on all the International Standards, except the EU standards only list mono-basic form.
- **2022 Sunsets: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (TC).** IOE generally used as sweetener, and binder. Used in dairy as probiotic and in baby food. The lead described the manufacturing process and ancillary substances. The NOSB recommended the removal of IOE at the last sunset review, however the NOP did not accept the recommendation, based in additional comment received during the proposed rule phase.
- **Fish oil discussion document.** The group discussed this briefly, and one of the leads suggested engaging NOAA, otherwise it will be difficult to move this forward. **The HS a**sked NOP for a contact

at NOAA to discuss standards for fish oil, sustainability standards, and how this information might inform the discussion document.

- **Update - Low acyl gellan gum questions.** SR will talk with DP.
- **Update - Red Jalapeno Pepper petition.** The NOSB already sent questions back to NOP to send to the petitioner.
- **Other.**
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

November 19, 2019

Low acyl gellan gum (LD) - petition sufficiency
Red jalapeño pepper (SE) - petition sufficiency
2022 Sunsets: Sodium bicarbonate(SE) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Ammonium bicarbonate (SE) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Ammonium carbonate (SE) - discuss/vote

December 3, 2019

2022 Sunsets: Kaolin (LD) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Waxes (Wood resin) (LD) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Carnauba wax (LD) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (TC) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (TC) - discuss/vote

December 17, 2019

2022 Sunsets: Colors (18) (TC) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Glycerin (TC) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Sodium hydroxide (HB) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Orange shellac (HB) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Turkish bay leaves (SR) - discuss/vote

January 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Ozone (SR) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Kelp (ARB) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Whey protein concentrate (ARB) - discuss/vote
Fish oil discussion document (TC)

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Cornstarch (AB) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Sweet potato starch (AB) - discuss/vote

February 4, 2020
February 18, 2020
March 3, 2020
March 17, 2020
April 7, 2020
April 21, 2020
May 5, 2020
May 19, 2020
June 2, 2020
June 16, 2020
July 7, 2020
July 21, 2020
August 4, 2020
August 18, 2020

September 1, 2020
September 15, 2020
October 6, 2020
October 20, 2020
November 3, 2020
November 17, 2020
December 1, 2020
December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Low acyl gellan gum	205.605	LD/SR	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 9.17.19. Sufficiency due 11.15.19. HS sent additional questions to petitioner 11.7.19	11.5.19 11.19.19	TBD
Red jalapeño pepper	205.606	SE	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 10.8.19. Sufficiency due 12.6.19. HS sent questions to petitioner 11.19.19. Waiting for response.	11.19.19	TBD

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Fish oil annotation	TC, HB, AB	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. Will	Spr 2020
L-Malic acid reclassification	TC/SR?	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19.	Spr 2020
Ion exchange filtration	SE/SR	NOP memo sent to NOSB 8.27.19. TR requested 9.3.19. TR due in ~ mid-January 2020. Discussion doc Spr 2020	Spr 2020
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Jul 2020.	Fall 2020
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 1.12.14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11.19.14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9.30.16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10.19.16. TR sufficiency due 12.20.16. TR found insufficient 12.20.16. Vote: 2.21.17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 7.10.17. Response due 09.8.17. TR found sufficient 8.1.17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc On hold
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 1.12.16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	12.3.19	"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.19	"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	1.7.20	“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	1.7.19	“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify	12.3.19	
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY	12.17.19	

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, November 19, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Scott Rice (SR); Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB), observing (JB)
Absent: Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Tom Chapman (TC); A-dae Briones (ARB); Michelle Arsenault (MA)
Staff: Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- November 5 notes
- Low acyl gellan gum (LD) - petition sufficiency
- Red jalapeño pepper (SE) - petition sufficiency
- 2022 Sunsets: Sodium bicarbonate(SE) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Ammonium bicarbonate (SE) - discuss
- 2022 Sunsets: Ammonium carbonate (SE) - discuss
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** November 5 were accepted as is.
- **Low acyl gellan gum (LD).** In the absence of LD, the Chair (AB) summarized the status of the subcommittee's petition review, including questions the subcommittee discussed during the previous call. A list of questions will be sent to NOP who will pass to the petitioner.
- **Red jalapeño pepper (SE) - petition sufficiency.** The lead (SE) summarized the petition and members discussed how to assess statements about whether adequate supply is available. The prevalence of organic jalapeño peppers (green) was noted and members questioned whether the petitioner had exhausted their options to source the ingredient. After discussion, members agreed the petition does not currently include sufficient justification. Questions for the petitioner will be sent to NOP who will pass to the petitioner.
- **2022 Sunsets: Sodium bicarbonate(SE) - discuss/vote.** The lead (SE) summarized uses of the ingredient, its source, and impacts. Members did not note concerns.
- **2022 Sunsets: Ammonium bicarbonate (SE) - discuss/vote.** The lead (SE) summarized uses of the ingredient, differences compared to sodium bicarbonate, its source, and environmental/health impacts. A member asked about other uses that would not be allowed under the annotation (as leaving agent) and suggested NOSB ask public to comment on other uses.
- **2022 Sunsets: Ammonium carbonate (SE) - discuss/vote.** The lead (SE) summarized uses of the ingredient, differences compared to sodium bicarbonate and ammonium bicarbonate, and environmental/health impacts.
- **Whey protein concentrate petition.** The NOP received a petition to remove whey protein concentrate from the National List (205.606). NOP noted the petition was incomplete and was returned to the petitioner for more information. Members discussed the previous sunset review and that NOP determined to not remove the ingredient (via notice and comment rulemaking).
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)
November 5, 2019

Low acyl gellan gum (LD) - petition sufficiency
Red jalapeño pepper - assign lead

November 19, 2019

Low acyl gellan gum (LD) - petition sufficiency
Red jalapeño pepper (SE) - petition sufficiency
2022 Sunsets: Sodium bicarbonate(SE) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Ammonium bicarbonate (SE) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Ammonium carbonate (SE) - discuss/vote

December 3, 2019

2022 Sunsets: Kaolin (LD) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Waxes (Wood resin) (LD) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Carnauba wax (LD) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (TC) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (TC) - discuss/vote

December 17, 2019

2022 Sunsets: Colors (18) (TC) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Glycerin (TC) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Sodium hydroxide (HB) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Orange shellac (HB) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Turkish bay leaves (SR) - discuss/vote

January 7, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Ozone (SR) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Kelp (ARB) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Whey protein concentrate (ARB) - discuss/vote

January 21, 2020

2022 Sunsets: Cornstarch (AB) - discuss/vote
2022 Sunsets: Sweet potato starch (AB) - discuss/vote

February 4, 2020
February 18, 2020
March 3, 2020
March 17, 2020
April 7, 2020
April 21, 2020
May 5, 2020
May 19, 2020
June 2, 2020
June 16, 2020
July 7, 2020
July 21, 2020
August 4, 2020
August 18, 2020
September 1, 2020
September 15, 2020
October 6, 2020
October 20, 2020
November 3, 2020
November 17, 2020
December 1, 2020
December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Low acyl gellan gum	205.605	LD/SR	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 9.17.19. Sufficiency due 11.15.19. HS sent additional questions to petitioner 11.7.19	11.5.19 11.19.19	TBD
Red jalapeño pepper	205.606	SE	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 10.8.19. Sufficiency due 12.6.19	11.19.19	TBD

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Fish oil annotation	TC, HB, AB	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19.	Spr 2020
L-Malic acid reclassification	TC/SR?	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19.	Spr 2020
Ion exchange filtration	SE/SR	NOP memo sent to NOSB 8.27.19. TR requested 9.3.19. TR due in ~ mid-January 2020. Discussion doc Spr 2020	Spr 2020
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Jul 2020.	Fall 2020
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 1.12.14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11.19.14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9.30.16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10.19.16. TR sufficiency due 12.20.16. TR found insufficient 12.20.16. Vote: 2.21.17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 7.10.17. Response due 09.8.17. TR found sufficient 8.1.17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc On hold
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 1.12.16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	12.3.19	"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.19	"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	1.7.20	"
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	1.7.19	"
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify	12.3.19	
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY	12.17.19	

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, November 5, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Steve Ela (SE); Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Scott Rice (SR); Harriet Behar (HB)
Absent: Tom Chapman (TC); A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- October 1 notes
- Low acyl gellan gum (LD) - petition sufficiency
- Red jalapeño pepper - assign lead Additional items
- Fish Oil - update
- L Malic Acid update
- Fermentation Products
- Assign discussion dates for work agenda items
- Whey Protein Concentrate
- Comments from Pittsburgh meeting
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** October 1 were accepted as is.
- **Low acyl gellan gum (LD/SR).** The lead summarized the petition and described the difference between the high acyl and low acyl forms. High acyl gellan gum is already on the National List. She also described the history of the earlier review and decision to add one and not the other, noting that both have the same CAS#. The HS noted a discrepancy in the petition regarding the NL section number. NOP will reach out to the petitioner to clarify that and a couple of other questions. Sufficiency will be deferred until a later call. SR will take over the review when LD rotates off the NOSB in January.
- **Red jalapeño pepper.** SE volunteered to lead this review.
- **Fish Oil.** HB will work on a discussion document with TC and AB.
- **L Malic Acid.** SR will prepare a discussion document for the Spring 2020 NOSB meeting.
- **Fermentation Products.** Several NOSB members discussed fermentation products at the Fall meeting, and determined that this may not be a project to undertake at this time. There are different types of fermentation, and the term fermentation is broad, and it is not clear how to move forward. The HS will discuss key questions and try to define a more focused scope.
- **Assigned discussion dates for work agenda items.** See table and lists below.
- **Whey Protein Concentrate (WPC).** The NOP received a petition to remove WPC, and the HS will also be reviewing WPC for sunset. The Subcommittee may develop discussion document for Spring 2020 meeting.
- **Comments from Pittsburgh meeting.** Deferred due to time.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)
October 15, 2019 – cancelled. Conflicts with comment webinar

November 5, 2019

- Low acyl gellan gum (LD) - petition sufficiency
- Red jalapeño pepper - assign lead

November 19, 2019

- Low acyl gellan gum (LD) - petition sufficiency
- Red jalapeño pepper (SE) - petition sufficiency
- 2022 Sunsets: Sodium bicarbonate(SE) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Ammonium bicarbonate (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Ammonium carbonate (SE) - discuss/vote

December 3, 2019

- 2022 Sunsets: Kaolin (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Waxes (Wood resin) (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Carnauba wax (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (TC) - discuss/vote

December 17, 2019

- 2022 Sunsets: Colors (18) (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Glycerin (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Sodium hydroxide (HB) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Orange shellac (HB) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Turkish bay leaves (SR) - discuss/vote

January 7, 2020

- 2022 Sunsets: Ozone (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Kelp (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Whey protein concentrate (ARB) - discuss/vote

January 21, 2020

- 2022 Sunsets: Cornstarch (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2022 Sunsets: Sweet potato starch (AB) - discuss/vote

February 4, 2020
February 18, 2020
March 3, 2020
March 17, 2020
April 7, 2020
April 21, 2020
May 5, 2020
May 19, 2020
June 2, 2020
June 16, 2020
July 7, 2020
July 21, 2020
August 4, 2020
August 18, 2020
September 1, 2020
September 15, 2020
October 6, 2020
October 20, 2020
November 3, 2020
November 17, 2020
December 1, 2020
December 15, 2020

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Low acyl gellan gum	205.605	LD/SR	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 9.17.19. Sufficiency due 11.15.19. HS sent additional questions to petitioner 11.7.19	11.5.19 11.19.19	TBD
Red jalapeño pepper	205.606	SE	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 10.8.19. Sufficiency due 12.6.19	11.19.19	TBD

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Fish oil annotation	TC, HB, AB	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19.	Spr 2020
L-Malic acid reclassification	TC/SR?	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19.	Spr 2020
Ion exchange filtration	SE/SR	NOP memo sent to NOSB 8.27.19. TR requested 9.3.19. TR due in ~ mid-January 2020. Discussion doc Spr 2020	Spr 2020
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Jul 2020.	Fall 2020
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 1.12.14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11.19.14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9.30.16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10.19.16. TR sufficiency due 12.20.16. TR found insufficient 12.20.16. Vote: 2.21.17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 7.10.17. Response due 09.8.17. TR found sufficient 8.1.17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc On hold
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 1.12.16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	11.19.19	"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.19	"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.20	"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	12.3.19	"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.7.19	"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	1.21.20	“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	1.7.20	“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove	1.7.19	“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify	12.3.19	
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.17.19	
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY	12.17.19	

Spring 2020 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 15, 2019
NOSB - Spring 2020 proposals due to NOP	Feb 20, 2020
New NOSB member training	Feb 25 - 26, 2020
NOP - Draft Spring 2020 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 2, 2020
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2020
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2020
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2020
Public comment webinars	Apr 21 & 23, 2020
Spring 2020 NOSB meeting - Crystal City, VA	Apr 28 - May 1, 2020

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, October 1, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Steve Ela (SE); Tom Chapman (TC);
Absent: Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Scott Rice (SR); A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- September 17 notes
- Products of Fermentation - Materials vs Handling Committee
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** September 17 were accepted as is.
- **Products of Fermentation - Materials vs Handling Committee.** A member asked for clarification about the goal of this project, what problem(s) it is trying to solve, and whether the topic is broader than fermentation products. The lead summarized some previous conversations around fermentation. Another member suggested that the work might clarify classification and criteria. Members discussed if this topic includes broader questions that also apply to crop/livestock inputs (source materials, excluded methods, etc.). A member noted the existing decision trees (NOP 5033-1 and NOP 5033-2) address fermentation. The group intends on discussing this further at the Fall meeting in Pittsburgh to articulate the issue(s).
- **Additional items.**
    - NOP provided links to information from the prior rulemaking to add gellan gum to the National List, which includes background on why low-acyl forms of gellan gum were excluded from the current listing. The information was provided in response to a question posed by the HS during their last call. High acyl gellan gum is on the NL, but low acyl is not, and was recently petitioned for addition.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

September 17, 2019
L-Malic Acid reclassification
Ion exchange filtration
Fish oil annotation
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions
October 1, 2019
Products of Fermentation - Materials vs Handling Committee.
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Low acyl gellan gum	**205.605**	LD		Petition sent to HS 09 17 19. Sufficiency due 11 15 19.		

2021 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed Voted**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP 2014 TR for microorganisms 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19 06 18 19	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19. TR found sufficient 06 04 19	06 04 19 07 16 19 08 06 19	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"

Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	“
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. TR sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency due 06 03 19. CS sent additional questions to NOP 06 18 19. Response to questions sent to HS. TR found sufficient 08 06 19	06 18 19 08 06 19	“
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	“
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	“
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	“
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	“
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	“
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	“
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	“
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	“

Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y. hosted panel instead	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. TR was not contracted. The NOSB hosted a panel in its place.	06 04 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19 08 06 19	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	07 16 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 14 19 via email	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 14 19 via email	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019.	Fall 2019
Fish oil annotation	TC, HB, AB	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 08 06 19.	Spr 2020
L-Malic acid reclassification	TC/SR?	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 08 06 19.	Spr 2020
Ion exchange filtration	SE/SR	NOP memo sent to NOSB 08 27 19. TR requested 09 03 19. TR due in ~ mid-January 2020.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify		
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, September 17, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Scott Rice (SR); Steve Ela (SE); Tom Chapman (TC)
Absent: A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- September 3 notes
- L-Malic Acid reclassification
- Ion exchange filtration
- Fish oil annotation
- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions
- Low acyl gellan gum petition - sufficiency and need for TR
- Products of Fermentation - Materials vs Handling Committee
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from** September 3 were approved as is.
- **L-Malic Acid reclassification.** The Chair confirmed that SR will lead this project.
- **Ion exchange filtration.** The TR request is in development and the NOP expects it could be completed by mid-January.
- **Fish oil annotation.** Several members of the Handling Subcommittee will develop a discussion document for the Spring NOSB meeting, and will begin work after the completion of the Fall 2019 meeting.
- **Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals (NVM) - summary of history and NOSB actions.** Members discussed the history and noted the current status of the listing for nutrient vitamins and minerals, as well as unresolved issues. During a previous review it was determined that changes would create a significant economic impact. The summary, which was incorporated into the sunset review for the Fall 2019 NOSB meeting, is intended to preserve institutional memory for future NOSB reviews.
- **Low acyl gellan gum petition. Petition received September 19.** LD volunteered to complete the petition sufficiency and then the HS will pass this along to another member as LD will complete her term in January. A member asked why the current National List excludes low acyl gellan gum. The NOP noted the 2008 NOSB recommendation includes some information. NOP will relay additional background to HS. The Subcommittee will work on this after the Fall 2019 meeting.
- **Products of Fermentation - Materials vs Handling Committee.** The group discussed the most appropriate Subcommittee to undertake this work, and determined that it fits best in Handling. Members will discuss this more on a later call. A member noted that this could also help inform the review of NVM.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

September 3, 2019
- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions
- Fish oil annotation
- L-Malic Acid reclassification

September 17, 2019
- L-Malic Acid reclassification
- Ion exchange filtration
- Fish oil annotation
- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions

October 1, 2019
- Products of Fermentation - Materials vs Handling Committee.

October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Low acyl gellan gum	**205.605**	LD		Petition sent to HS 09 17 19. Sufficiency due 11 15 19.		

2021 Sunsets **TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019**						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed Voted**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP 2014 TR for microorganisms 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19 06 18 19	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"

L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19. TR found sufficient 06 04 19	06 04 19 07 16 19 08 06 19	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. TR sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency due 06 03 19. CS sent additional questions to NOP 06 18 19. Response to questions sent to HS. TR found sufficient 08 06 19	06 18 19 08 06 19	"
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"

Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y. hosted panel instead	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. TR was not contracted. The NOSB hosted a panel in its place.	06 04 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19 08 06 19	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	07 16 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 14 19 via email	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 14 19 via email	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD

Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019.	Fall 2019
Fish oil annotation	TC, HB, AB	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 08 06 19.	Spr 2020
L-Malic acid reclassification	TC/SR?	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 08 06 19.	Spr 2020
Ion exchange filtration	SE/SR	NOP memo sent to NOSB 08 27 19. TR requested 09 03 19. TR due in ~ mid-January 2020.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify		
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, September 3, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Steve Ela (SE)
Absent: Scott Rice (SR); Tom Chapman (TC); A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP); Paul Lewis (PL)

Agenda

- August 6 notes
- Update from Exec Comm meeting
- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions
- L-Malic acid reclassification (TR) - discuss
- Fish Oil annotation (TC) - discuss
- Ion exchange filtration
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from August 6** were approved as written.
- **Update from Executive Committee meeting.** A member gave a brief summary of the Handling update presented at the last Executive call.
- **Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions.** Discussion deferred to next call.
- **L-Malic acid reclassification (SR).** The reclassification of L-Malic acid was approved as a work agenda item by the NOP on August 6. The HS feels it is straight forward and will develop a proposal for the Spring 2020 meeting.
- **Fish Oil annotation (TC).** A member briefly summarized comments, both from stakeholders and NOSB members regarding fish oil. Another member suggested that the lead write a draft document prior to the Fall meeting, so the rest of the NOSB members have a chance to discuss it.
- **Ion exchange filtration.** The group discussed ion exchange filtration, specifically whether or not resins are interactive or if they are solely a food contact surface. The Chair emphasized that if the contact causes a chemical change, then they may be considered processing aids. The group discussed the distinction between resins and "recharge materials", noting that resins are considered food contact materials and are not required to be on the National List (NL). Recharge materials, such as sodium hydroxide, are on the National List, but are not specifically annotated to indicated that. The Handling Subcommittee discussed questions for the Technical Report request.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

August 6, 2019 - Last call before proposals are due

2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) - discuss TR/vote
2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2019 - cancelled

Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions
Fish oil annotation
L-Malic Acid reclassification

September 3, 2019

Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions
Fish oil annotation
L-Malic Acid reclassification

September 17, 2019

L-Malic Acid reclassification
Ion exchange filtration
Fish oil annotation
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions

October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**

2021 Sunsets **TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019**						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed Voted**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"

Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP 2014 TR for microorganisms 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19 06 18 19	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19. TR found sufficient 06 04 19	06 04 19 07 16 19 08 06 19	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. TR sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency due 06 03 19. CS sent additional questions to NOP 06 18 19. Response to questions sent to HS. TR found sufficient 08 06 19	06 18 19 08 06 19	"
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"

Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y. hosted panel instead	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. TR was not contracted. The NOSB hosted a panel in its place.	06 04 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19 08 06 19	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	07 16 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 14 19 via email	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 14 19 via email	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**

Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019.	Fall 2019
Fish oil annotation	TC + (HB/AB)?	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 08 06 19.	Spr 2020
L-Malic acid reclassification	TC/SR?	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 08 06 19.	Spr 2020
Ion exchange filtration		NOP memo sent to NOSB 08 27 19. TR requested 09 03 19.	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify		
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, August 6, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Scott Rice, (SR); Harriet Behar (HB); Steve Ela (SE); Tom Chapman (TC)
Absent: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- July 16 notes
- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) - discuss TR/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss/vote
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from July 16 were accepted as is.**
- **2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR).** The TR was found thorough and sufficient, and the lead noted that it did not introduce any new information that would cause the NOSB to remove it from the list. The lead summarized the uses, alternatives, and previous public comment. A member noted that there are alternative acids on the list, however they do not provide identical functional properties.

  Motion to remove ascorbic acid from the National List
  Motion by: SR
  Seconded by: HB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: L-malic acid (SR).** Members discussed the review and a member's question about the use of petroleum in one of the two manufacturing processes for synthetically produced L-Malic Acid. The TR does not answer this question. The HS determined that the amount is insignificant.

  Motion to remove L-malic acid from the National List
  Motion by: SR
  Seconded by: TC
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC).** The members discussed the separate request to work on an annotation for fish oil to address over-exploitation. The NOP approved the request this week and the HS will proceed with its review. The lead will add a sentence to the sunset review about the approval of the work agenda request and forward the document to the NOP.

Motion to remove fish oil from the National List
Motion by: TC
Seconded by: SR
Additional discussion: None
Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB).** Deferred. Vote will be conducted via email. MA will contact the lead and request documents.

  Motion to remove Seaweed, Pacific kombu from the National List
  Motion by: Asa Bradman
  Seconded by: Steve Ela
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 1 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB).** Deferred. Vote will be conducted via email. MA will contact the lead and request documents.

  Motion to remove Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) from the National List
  Motion by: Asa Bradman
  Seconded by: Steve Ela
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **Research Priorities.** The HS briefly discussed the research priorities and will send the completed list to the Materials Subcommittee.
- **Additional items.** None**.**
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

July 16, 2019
2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2019 - Last call before proposals are due
2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) - discuss TR/vote
2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2019
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions
L-Malic acid reclassification (TR) - discuss
Fish Oil annotation (TC) - discuss

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**

2021 Sunsets **TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019**						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed Voted**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP 2014 TR for microorganisms 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19 06 18 19	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19. TR found sufficient 06 04 19	06 04 19 07 16 19 08 06 19	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"

Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. TR sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency due 06 03 19. CS sent additional questions to NOP 06 18 19. Response to questions sent to HS. TR found sufficient 08 06 19	06 18 19 08 06 19	"
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"

Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y. hosted panel instead	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. TR was not contracted. The NOSB hosted a panel in its place.	06 04 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19 08 06 19	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	07 16 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06 19	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06 19	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019.	Fall 2019
Fish oil annotation	TC	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved for addition to work agenda 8.6.19	TBD
L-Malic Acid	TC	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved for addition to work agenda 8.6.19	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify		
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, July 16, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Scott Rice, (SR); Steve Ela (SE); Harriet Behar (HB); Jesse Buie (JB) - observer
Absent: A-dae Briones (ARB); Tom Chapman (TC)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- July 2 notes
- 2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from July 2** were approved as is.

- **2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR).** The lead summarized the manufacture and uses of L-malic acid, which is used primarily in beverages. According to NOP Guidance 5033 and 5033-1 L-Malic acid is synthetic. The HS is seeking approval to add this to its work agenda to reclassify it. Until it is reclassified it will continue to be allowed. The lead will research some additional information before the HS votes on it on the next call.

- **2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR).** Magnesium sulfate, mined, has a wide variety of uses in food processing and personal care products. It is used as a coagulant, and is considered GRAS. The lead discussed effects on human health (negligible) and environmental impacts, and noted the public comments received during the first posting in the Spring.

  Motion to remove magnesium sulfate at §205.605
  Motion by: SR
  Seconded by: HB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR).** The lead summarized the listing for perlite, including it's uses. Perlite is mined and is a used as a filter aid in food processing. Stakeholders and previous Boards have supported relisting.

  Motion to remove perlite at §205.605
  Motion by: SR
  Seconded by: HB

Additional discussion: None
Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR).** The lead summarized the listing for activated charcoal, including its uses as a filtering aid in food processing, as well as public comments from the Spring posting.

  Motion to remove activated charcoal at §205.605
  Motion by: SR
  Seconded by: AB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR).** The lead summarized the substance which is used as a chemical leavener considered essential by manufacturers. There were several comments about phosphates in the human diet, and the lead noted that consumption of phosphates is not considered an issue unless consumed in large quantities. A member noted that initially there was concern that when sodium acid pyrophosphate was added to the list there would be a glutton of phosphates also added, but the fears have not been borne out.

  Motion to remove sodium acid pyrophosphate at §205.605
  Motion by: SR
  Seconded by: SE
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 1 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (HB).** A member summarized the review for the lead, noting uses, sources, and international allowances. Gelatin is universally allowed.

  Motion to remove gelatin at §205.606
  Motion by: HB
  Seconded by: AB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (HB).** A member summarized the uses and manufacture of orange pulp, noting that it is made from conventionally produced oranges. The group discussed the sole source of orange pulp, and the lack of market incentive to produce it organically since it is on 205.606.

  Motion to remove orange pulp, dried at §205.606
  Motion by: HB
  Seconded by: AB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 4 No: 1 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **Additional items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous HS Notes]

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

July 2, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) deferred

July 16, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2019 - Last call before proposals are due

- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) - discuss TR/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2019

- Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - summary of history and NOSB actions

September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**

2021 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed Voted**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP 2014 TR for microorganisms 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19 06 18 19	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18 19	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19. TR found sufficient 06 04 19	06 04 19 07 16 19 08 06 19	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"

Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. TR sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency due 06 03 19. CS sent additional questions to NOP 06 18 19. Response to questions sent to HS	06 18 19 08 06 19	"
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21 19	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 19	"
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y. hosted panel instead	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. TR was not contracted. The NOSB hosted a panel in its place.	06 04 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 19 08 06 19	"

Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	07 16 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06 19	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06 19	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019.	Fall 2019
Fish oil annotation	TC	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19	TBD
L-Malic Acid	TC	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify		
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, July 2, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Scott Rice, (SR); Steve Ela (SE); Harriet Behar (HB); Tom Chapman (TC); Jesse Buie (JB) - observer
Absent: A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- June 18 notes
- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from June 18** were accepted with the addition of the vote summary for dairy cultures.
- **2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB).** Deferred to next call
- **2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB).** Deferred to next call
- **2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC).** The lead summarized the review of calcium chloride, including the use and previous comments.
  Motion to remove calcium chloride at §205.605
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: HB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC).** The lead summarized uses and applications, as well as public comment received in response to the questions from the first posting.
  Motion to remove potassium iodide at §205.605(a)
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: SR
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC).** The lead summarized uses and applications, as well as public comment received in response to the questions from the first posting. Commenters were supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove ferrous sulfate at §205.605
Motion by: TC
Seconded by: AB
Additional discussion: The HS Chair emphasized that iron supplementation is viewed as beneficial to public health
Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals (NVM) (TC).** The lead summarized the substance, and the comments that were received in response to questions during the previous posting. The HS moved to a vote on the sunset review and then discussed the work agenda item for an annotation change, which is currently on hold pending NOP action. During a previous review the NOSB considered and approved most of the vitamins and minerals contained in this listing, and rejected ~20% of them. This would have eliminated many infant formulas from organic certification. Since breastfeeding is not an option for everyone, and having an organic soy source is necessary, this would have eliminated that possibility. The HS is interested in writing a discussion document for the fall meeting to elicit additional discussion and to pass along the historical knowledge to future Boards.
  Motion to remove NVM at §205.605(b)
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: HB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC).** The lead summarized the responses to the questions that were posed in the Spring. Comments were mixed, but most were supportive of relisting. Potassium phosphate is used in 'made with organic' products. The lead also noted that potassium phosphate can be used in a blend as a source of potassium for nutrient fortification, although this may not be a current use.
  Motion to remove potassium phosphate at §205.605(b)
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: SE
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC).** Discussion and vote deferred to next call while NOP verifies the status of the work agenda request to annotate the listing to address conservation concerns. The HS received near-universal support for the annotation.. NOP will address it during the July 16 Executive call. The HS will discuss and vote on the August 6 call.

- **Additional items:**
  - The group discussed a potential TR for sodium hydroxide and determined that it may not be needed in light of the availability of other resources.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous HS Notes]

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

June 18, 2019

- Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets.
- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) TR sufficiency completed?
- 2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (LD) - discuss/vote

July 2, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) deferred

July 16, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2019 - Last call before proposals are due

- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2019
September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**

2021 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed Voted**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP 2014 TR for microorganisms 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 06 18	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19. TR found sufficient 06 04 19	06 04 07 16	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"

Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. TR sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency due 06 03 19. CS sent additional questions to NOP 06 18 19	06 18 07 16	“
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	“
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y. hosted panel instead	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. TR was not contracted. The NOSB hosted a panel in its place.	06 04	“
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02 08 06	“

Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	07 16	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
NVM history summary		relay the history to a future iteration of the Board.	
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019.	Fall 2019
Fish oil annotation	TC	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19	TBD
L-Malic Acid	TC	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19	TBD

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)

New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify		
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, June 18, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Scott Rice, (SR); Steve Ela (SE); Harriet Behar (HB)
Absent: Tom Chapman (TC); A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- June 4 notes
- Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets.
- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) TR sufficiency completed?
- 2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2019 Research priorities
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from June 4** were accepted as is.

- **Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets.** The HS determined the need for TRs for the 2022 sunset substances. See table below.

- **2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR).** The TR was found accessible and easy to understand, although it did not address a full description of the fermentation process or include discussion of GMOs. The CS will send the NOP additional questions before determining TR sufficiency.

- **2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE).** The HS discussed the listings for dairy cultures and microorganisms during the ES call, hoping to get feedback from the NOP about the redundancy of the two listings. The NOP did not provide feedback, so the HS will proceed with the plan to let dairy cultures sunset. The lead will address ancillary substances in the review documents. The group also discussed rennet and whether or not it is included in microorganisms, which is a very broad category. Members made modifications to the draft review based on the discussion.

  Motion to remove dairy cultures from the NL
  Motion by: SE
  Seconded by: SR
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB).** Deferred to next call.

- **2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB).** Deferred to next call.

- **2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (LD).** The lead summarized the uses of alginic acid in soups and soup mixes, noting that it is derived from seaweed. The TR indicated minimum environmental issues. The NOSB received no comments from manufacturers, and is interested in garnering feedback from stakeholders as to whether it is in use or necessary, and whether there are alternatives. The Subcommittee voted to remove alginic acid from the National List.

  Motion to remove alginic acid from the National List at §205.605 based on essentiality
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: HB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (LD).** The lead summarized the uses of citric acid and noted that it is produced via fermentation.

  Motion to remove citric acid from the National List at §205.605
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: SR
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (LD).** The lead summarized the uses of lactic acid, which is a carbohydrate fermentation product. Lactic acid is widely used in almost every segment of the food industry, where it carries out a wide range of functions.

  Motion to remove lactic acid from the National List at §205.605
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: AB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2019 Research priorities.** Members discussed the current list of research priorities which includes Chlorine materials and alternatives, BPA, and celery powder.

- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

June 4, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Enzymes (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Microorganisms (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Yeast (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB) - discuss/vote
L-Malic acid TR sufficiency (SR)
Research priorities. Discuss
Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets and assign leads to 9 additional entrees

June 18, 2019

Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets.
2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) TR sufficiency completed?
2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (LD) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (LD) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (LD) - discuss/vote

July 2, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote

July 16, 2019

2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2019 - Last call before proposals are due

2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2019
September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
2021 Sunsets **TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019**						

Substance	National List §	Con-tact	TR re-quest?	Notes	Scheduled, Discussed Voted	Target meeting
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP See 2014 TR for microorganisms 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 06 18	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19. TR found sufficient 06 04 19	06 04 07 16	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. TR sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency	06 18 07 16	"

				due 06 03 19. CS sent additional questions to NOP 06 18 19		
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y. hosted panel instead	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. TR was not contracted. The NOSB hosted a panel in its place.	06 04	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"

Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	07 02	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019.	Fall 2019

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018

Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB	Y	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TAP: 1995 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB	N	Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB	N	Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify		
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC	N	Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC	N	Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, June 4, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); A-dae Briones (ARB); Scott Rice, (SR); Steve Ela (SE); Tom Chapman (TC)
Absent: None
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- May 7 and May 21 notes
- L-Malic acid TR sufficiency (SR)
- 2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Enzymes (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Microorganisms (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Yeast (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- Research priorities. Discuss
- Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets and assign leads to 9 additional entrees
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from May 7 and May 21** were accepted as is.
- **L-Malic acid TR sufficiency (SR).** The lead indicated that the TR did a good job explaining the manufacturing processes, and it was very thorough and accessible to the reader. The TR was found sufficient. The HS will discuss the proposal on July 16.
- **2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE).** The lead summarized the substance and the group discussed the treatment for ancillary substances. The HS will add any ancillaries to the ongoing list as a way to keep track of them, but will not review them individually at this time. A member noted that some dairy cultures and enzymes are genetically modified and would like to add a sentence to the review acknowledging that and the fact that certifiers require proof of non-GMO status. Members also discussed the potential for removing dairy cultures from the list as the microorganisms listing is redundant. The HS is seeking feedback from the NOP about this option, and will pose this question to the NOP on the next Exec call.

- **2021 Sunsets: Enzymes (SE).** The lead summarized the substance and the HS moved to a vote.
  Motion to remove enzymes from the National List at 205.605(a)
  Motion by: SE
  Seconded by: HB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Microorganisms (SE).** The HS is contemplating the removal of dairy cultures from the National List as it was identified by several stakeholders as a redundant listing with microorganisms. The lead added text to the review and proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to remove microorganisms from the National List at 205.605(a)
  Motion by: SE
  Seconded by: LD
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Yeast (SE).** The lead summarized the review and modified the draft based on conversation on the call. The HS proceeded to a vote.

  Motion to remove yeast from the National List at 205.605(a)
  Motion by: SE
  Seconded by: AB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

  (One of the members dropped off the call due to lack of a connection, as reflected in the votes below).

- **2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB).** The lead summarized the substance uses and public comment. A member added that availability of tocopherols can be volatile and inconsistent.

  Motion to remove tocopherols from the National List at 205.605(b)
  Motion by: AB
  Seconded by: SE
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB).** The lead incorporated information from the celery powder panel and the public comment from the Spring NOSB meeting. It's clear from comments that celery powder is essential to the industry, although the lead noted the need for more research into organic production.

  Motion to remove celery powder from the National List at 205.606
  Motion by: AB
  Seconded by: SR
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB).** Deferred to next call
- **2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB).** Deferred to next call
- **Research priorities.** Deferred to next call.
- **Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets and assign leads to 9 additional entrees (see below)**
- **Other:**
  - **Ascorbic acid.** TR sufficiency due June 3. The HS will determine sufficiency before the next HS call and let the NOP know if the petition can be posted to the website.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

May 21, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote

June 4, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Enzymes (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Microorganisms (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Yeast (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB) - discuss/vote
- L-Malic acid TR sufficiency (SR)
- Research priorities. Discuss
- Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets and assign leads to 9 additional entrees

June 18, 2019

- Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets.
- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) TR sufficiency completed?
- 2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (LD) - discuss/vote

July 2, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote

July 16, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2019 - Last call before proposals are due

- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2019

September 3, 2019

September 17, 2019

October 1, 2019

October 15, 2019

November 5, 2019

November 19, 2019

December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**

2021 Sunsets **TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019**						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed Voted**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP See 2014 TR for microorganisms 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04 06 18	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19. TR found sufficient 06 04 19	06 04 07 16	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"

Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. TR sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency due 06 03 19.	06 18 07 16	“
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	“
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y. hosted panel instead	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. TR was not contracted. The NOSB hosted a panel in its place.	06 04	“
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“

Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	06 18	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019.	Fall 2019

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD		Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC		Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC		Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR		Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB		Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Carnauba wax	205.606	LD		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify		
Colors (18) Beet juice extract color; Beta-carotene extract color; Black currant juice color; Black/purple carrot juice color; Blueberry juice color; Carrot juice color; Cherry juice color; Chokeberry, aronia juice color; Elderberry juice color; Grape juice color; Grape skin extract color; Paprika color; Pumpkin juice color; Purple sweet potato juice color; Red cabbage extract color; Red radish extract color; Saffron extract color; Turmeric extract color	205.606	TC		Sunset date: Beta carotene 5/29/2023; All others 3/15/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		TC		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2013 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY		

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, May 21, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB)), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Steve Ela (SE); Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair
Absent: A-dae Briones (ARB); Tom Chapman (TC); Scott Rice, (SR)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- May 7 notes
- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB) - discuss/vote
- L-Malic acid TR sufficiency (SR)
- Research Priorities prelim discussion
- Assign leads to 2022 sunsets, schedule time for TR needs discussion
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from May 7 were accepted as is.**
- **2021 Sunsets: Calcium citrate (LD).** The lead summarized the substance, noting that it is allowed internationally, and there was no new information about human health or use patterns provided during the last comment period. The majority of commenters supported relisting.

  Motion to remove calcium citrate from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: AS
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 5 Abstain: 0 Absent: 2 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Potassium citrate (LD).** The lead summarized the substance, including international usage and the public comments.

  Motion to remove potassium citrate from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: LD
  Seconded by: SE
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Sodium citrate (LD).** The lead summarized the substance uses, including international use, and the public comments.

Motion to remove sodium citrate from 205.605(b)
Motion by: LD
Seconded by: HB
Additional discussion: None
Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB).** The lead summarized the substance and its uses. It is an oxidizer and therefore is used as a sanitizer and disinfectant. Universally supported and used extensively.

  Motion to remove hydrogen peroxide from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: AB
  Seconded by: HB
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB).** The lead summarized the substance and its uses, as well as public comments. Peracetic acid is widely supported and used. The lead has reached out to a material review organization regarding inerts and is awaiting feedback.

  Motion to remove peracetic acid from 205.605(b)
  Motion by: AB
  Seconded by: SE
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Absent: 3 Recuse: 0

- **L-Malic acid TR sufficiency (SR).** Deferred to next call
- **Researched priorities.** Deferred to next call
- **Assigned leads to 2022 sunsets.** See table below
- **Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets.** Deferred to next call
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

May 7, 2019

May 21, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Calcium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Potassium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Sodium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote

June 4, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Enzymes (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Microorganisms (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Yeast (SE) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss/vote

2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote
L-Malic acid TR sufficiency (SR)
Research priorities. Discuss
Determine TR needs for 2022 sunsets

June 18, 2019
2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (LD) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (LD) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (LD) - discuss/vote

July 2, 2019
2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote

July 16, 2019
2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2019 - Last call before proposals are due
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2019
September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**

2021 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed Voted**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation to renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify	06 18	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP See 2014 TR for microorganisms 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19	07 04 07 16	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"

Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. Tr sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency due 06 03 19.	07 16	"
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18.	06 04	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	06 04	"

Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	TR: None 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2015 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	Fall 2019

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)	LD		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)	SE		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)	LD		Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)	SE		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)	TC		Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)	SR		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)	HB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cellulose (CAS #9004-34-6)	205.605(b)	?		Sunset date: 11/3/2023 2016/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Chlorine materials (i) Calcium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	?		Sunset date: 03/15/2022 2011/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot 2017/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Chlorine materials (ii) Chlorine dioxide	205.605(b)	?		Sunset date: 03/15/2022 2011/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot 2017/Fall - Rec to Renew		

Chlorine materials (iv) Sodium hypochlorite	205.605(b)	?		Sunset date: 03/15/2022 2011/Fall - Rec to Amend Annot 2017/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606	TC		Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606	ARB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606	HB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606	AB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606	AB		Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Turkish bay leaves	205.606	SR		Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Whey protein concentrate	205.606	ARB		Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Carnauba wax		?		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Fall - Rec to Reclassify		
Colors 18 to be added to table later)		?		Sunset date: Beta carotine 5/29/2023 All others 3/15/2022 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		
Glycerin (CAS # 56-81-5)		?		Sunset date: 3/15/2022 (different section of List) 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew 2015/Spring - Rec to RECLASSIFY		

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019

NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, May 7, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB)), Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Steve Ela (SE); Tom Chapman (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; A-dae Briones (ARB)
Absent: Scott Rice, (SR)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- March 5 notes
- Discussion of the Seattle meeting
- Assign dates for review of sunsets and petitions
- L-Malic acid TR sufficiency due May 17.
- Ascorbic acid TR sufficiency due June 3
- Other
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from March 5** were approved with no changes.
- **Discussion of the Seattle meeting.** The group had a follow up conversation about celery powder and the call for proposals for an OREI grant.
- **Assign dates for review of sunsets and petitions.** See table below
- **Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA.** This work agenda item has been on hold, and the HS will discuss it later in the summer.
- **Annotation for fish oil. The HS w**ould like to add this to its work agenda and will submit the request on the May 13 Executive team call.
- **Work agenda requests** –
- **L-Malic.** Information in the technical report indicates that L-Malic acid should be reclassified from synthetic to non-synthetic. The HS will submit a request to add this to its work agenda. **Malic acid TR sufficiency due May 17.** Discussion was scheduled for July 17.
- **Ascorbic acid TR sufficiency due June 4.** Discussion was scheduled for July 17.
- **Other**
    - **Dairy cultures and microorganisms.** Members discussed the comments the NOSB received about combining the listing for dairy cultures and microorganisms, noting that these listings are redundant. The HS will submit a work agenda request to add this to its work agenda.
    - **Sunset reviews.** Members discussed the process for reviewing the next set of sunset substances, as the latest rulemaking (AMS-NOP-14-05) altered the schedule.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)
April 2, 2019 - cancelled
April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar
May 7, 2019

May 21, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium citrate (LD) - discuss/vote

June 4, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Dairy cultures (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Enzymes (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Microorganisms (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Yeast (SE) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss/vote

June 18, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (LD) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (LD) - discuss/vote

July 2, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss/vote

July 16, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (ES) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2019 - Last call before proposals are due

- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss/vote
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2019
September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**

2021 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP See 2014 TR for microorganisms 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 18	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	SR	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. TR sent to HS 03 20 19. TR Suff due 05 17 19	07 16	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	"
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	"
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"

Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	SR	Y	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019. Tr sent to HS 04 04 19. Sufficiency due 06 03 19.	07 16	“
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2017 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	07 16	“
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	05 21	“
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	“
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18.	06 04	“
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	07 02	“

Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation 2019 TR Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings. TR sent to HS 01 30 2019. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	06 04	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation	06 04	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	08 06	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	Fall 2019

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

2022 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2019, Summary: Spr 2020, Review: Fall 2020						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Kaolin	205.605(a)			Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		Summary: Spr 2020 Review: Fall 2020
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)			Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Waxes—nonsynthetic (Wood resin)	205.605(a)			Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium bicarbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)			Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ammonium carbonate—for use only as a leavening agent	205.605(b)			Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)			Sunset date 3/15/2022 2016 TR for Phosphates 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Ozone	205.605(b)			Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Sodium hydroxide—prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables	205.605(b)			Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CAS # 9005-80-5)	205.606			Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		"
Kelp—for use only as a thickener and dietary supplement	205.606			Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Orange shellac-unbleached (CAS # 9000-59-3)	205.606			Sunset date 3/15/2022 2014 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"
Cornstarch (native)	205.606			Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		"

Sweet potato starch—for bean thread production only.	205.606			Sunset date 3/15/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Renew		“
Turkish bay leaves	205.606			Sunset date 6/27/2022 TR: None 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“
Whey protein concentrate	205.606			Sunset date 6/27/2022 2015 TR 2015/Fall - Rec to Remove		“

Fall 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
New NOSB member training	TBD Feb/Mar 2020
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	May 3, 2019
NOSB Request for TRs for 2022 sunset materials	Jun 12, 2019
NOP - Draft Fall 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Aug 5, 2018
NOSB - Fall 2019 proposals due to NOP	Aug 15, 2018
NOP - Post proposals	On or before Sep 4, 2018
Public comment closes	Oct 3, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 7, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Oct 14, 2019
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2019
Fall 2019 NOSB meeting - Pittsburgh, PA	Oct 23-25, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, March 5, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB)), Chair; Scott Rice, (SR); Harriet Behar (HB); Steve Ela (SE)
Absent: Tom Chapman (TC); Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Notes
- Celery powder panel logistics, facilitation, intros, etc.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Notes from February 19 and February 20** were accepted as is
- **Celery powder panel logistics, facilitation, intros, etc.**
    - All four panelists are confirmed
    - The HS Chair will compile questions, some of which were included in the sunset review for celery powder, and send to it to the NOP to forward to the panelists ahead of the NOSB meeting. The NOSB will ask for written responses, if the panelists have time.
    - Panel logistics: Each panelist will have 10 - 15 minutes for a presentation, ideally that includes responses to questions. 30 minutes Q & A with the NOSB.
    - The Handling Chair will introduce the panelists.
- **Research priorities.** The Chair will recirculate the Fall 2018 research priorities, so the members can begin thinking about potential priorities for 2019. Several topics were suggested including: food safety packaging issues; occupational exposure hazards of chlorine compounds; and sanitizers. A review of sanitizers is on the Materials Subcommittee work agenda, and the HS members discussed potential other components that pertain to Handling. The Subcommittee discussed the need to document a process for future boards as they review petitions for sanitizers.
- **Other**
    - The HS cancelled the March 19 call
    - The HS Chair will not be available for the April 2 call. The Vice Chair will lead the meeting.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)
March 5, 2019
    Discuss celery powder panel
March 19, 2019 - cancelled
April 2, 2019
April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar
May 7, 2019
May 21, 2019
June 4, 2019
June 18, 2019

July 2, 2019
July 16, 2019
August 6, 2019
August 20, 2019
September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Silver Dihydrogen Citrate Petition Addendum #1 Petition addendum #2	205.605(b)	TC/ SE	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 01 24 17. Response/request for TR due 03 28 17. Petition found sufficient 03 07 17. HS requested TR 03 07 14. TR in development. Petition addendum sent to HS 08 03 17. TR sent to HS 10 19 17/ Suff due 12 19 17. HS sent additional questions to TR contractor 12 05 17. TR under revision. Revised TR sent to HS 02 21 18. Response due 04 23 18. TR found sufficient 05 15 18. Petition addendum sent to HS 06 29 18.	02 19 19 02 20 19	Spr 2019
Pullulan	205.605(a)	LD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 02 27 18. Sufficiency due 04 30 18. Petition found suff 04 03 18. HS requested TR 04 03 18. TR sent to HS 09 12 18. Response due 11 12 18. TR found sufficient 10 02 18	11 20 18	Spr 2019
Collagen Gel (casing)	§205.606	AB	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 03 23 18. Petition Sufficiency due 5 22 18. Petition found sufficient 5 15 18. HS requested TR 5 15 18. TR in development. Expected Sep 2018. TR sent to HS 10 30 18. Response due 12 28 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor. Revised TR sent to HS 01 30 19. Response due 03 31 19. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	11 20 2018 01 29 2019 02 05 2019 02 20 2019	Spr 2019

2021 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP See 2014 TR for microorganisms 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	ES	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec	01 29 19	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	"
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	"
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	ES	Y	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019	01 29 19	"

Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	"
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	"
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	"
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	"
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	"
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	"
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. May not request TR, but hold panel instead.	02 19 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings TR	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 08 19 02 05 19	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Celery Powder panel	ALL	Discussed 02 05 19, 02 19 19, 03 05 19	Spr 2019
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	Fall 2019

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, February 19, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB)), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Tom Chapman (TC) Scott Rice, (SR); A-dae Briones (ARB); Harriet Behar (HB)
Absent: Steve Ela (SE)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC) - discuss proposal/vote
- Collagen Gel (casing) - discuss proposal/vote
- Panel logistics, facilitation, intros, etc.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC).** The members discussed the current proposal, including the concerns that were raised in public comments at the Fall 2018 meeting. Two aspects under discussion pertain to medical applications and environmental concerns. Several of those concerns are addressed in the document, and the group discussed others. The lead will make some additions based on the conversation and the group moved to a vote.

  Motion to classify silver dihydrogen citrate (SDC) as petitioned as agricultural synthetic
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: LD
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

  Motion to add silver dihydrogen citrate (SDC) at §205.605(b)
  Motion by: TC
  Seconded by: LD
  Additional discussion: None
  Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Collagen Gel (casing).** The group reviewed the classification of collagen gel based on the materials classification guidance and technical report (TR), acknowledging that it isn't straight forward. Members also discussed ancillary substances, and collagen gel in relation to gelatin and glycerin. The group discussed voting on ag/non-ag separate from synthetic or non-synthetic. The lead will modify the draft document and send it to the members for email votes since the proposal submission deadline is this week.

  Motion to classify collagen gel as agricultural.
  Motion by: Asa Bradman
  Seconded by: Harriet Behar
  Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 1 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

Motion to add collagen gel as petitioned at §205.606.
Motion by: Asa Bradman
Seconded by: Tom Chapman
Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1 Recuse: 0

- **Celery powder panel logistics, facilitation, intros, etc.** The group briefly discussed logistics for the panel and will discuss this on the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal submission deadline.
    2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss
    Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC) - discuss proposal
    2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (ES) - discuss TR if available
    2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB) - discuss
    2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss
    2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB) - discuss
February 20, 2019 - Additional call
March 5, 2019
    Discuss celery powder panel
March 19, 2019
April 2, 2019
April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar
May 7, 2019
May 21, 2019
June 4, 2019
June 18, 2019
July 2, 2019
July 16, 2019
August 6, 2019
August 20, 2019
September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Silver Dihydrogen Citrate Petition Addendum #1 Petition addendum #2	205.605(b)	TC/ SE	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 01 24 17. Response/request for TR due 03 28 17. Petition found sufficient 03 07 17. HS requested TR 03 07 14. TR in development. Petition addendum sent to HS 08 03 17. TR sent to HS 10 19 17/ Suff due 12 19 17. HS sent additional questions to TR contractor 12 05 17. TR under revision. Revised TR sent to HS 02 21 18. Response due 04 23 18. TR found sufficient 05 15 18. Petition addendum sent to HS 06 29 18.	02 19 19 02 20 19	Spr 2019
Pullulan	205.605(a)	LD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 02 27 18. Sufficiency due 04 30 18. Petition found suff 04 03 18. HS requested TR 04 03 18. TR sent to HS 09 12 18. Response due 11 12 18. TR found sufficient 10 02 18	11 20 18	Spr 2019
Collagen Gel (casing)	§205.606	AB	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 03 23 18. Petition Sufficiency due 5 22 18. Petition found sufficient 5 15 18. HS requested TR 5 15 18. TR in development. Expected Sep 2018. TR sent to HS 10 30 18. Response due 12 28 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor. Revised TR sent to HS 01 30 19. Response due 03 31 19. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	11 20 2018 01 29 2019 02 05 2019 02 20 2019	Spr 2019

2021 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"

Citric acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	“
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP See 2014 TR for microorganisms 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	“
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	ES	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec	01 29 19	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	ES	Y	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019	01 29 19	“
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	“
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“

Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	"
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	"
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. May not request TR, but hold panel instead.	02 19 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings TR	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 08 19 02 05 19	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD

Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Celery Powder panel	ALL	Discussed 02 05 19, 02 19 19	Spr 2019
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	Fall 2019

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, February 19, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB)), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Tom Chapman (TC) Scott Rice, (SR)
Absent: Steve Ela (SE); A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB) - discuss
- Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC) - discuss proposal
- Panel logistics, facilitation, intros, etc.
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC).** The lead discussed the category of nutrient vitamins and minerals, noting the history and controversy of this listing. The HS will include questions for public comment in the first posting of the review.
- **2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB).** The lead summarized the review, noting that peracetic acid is essential and a key component in sanitizing and food safety.
- **2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB).** The lead discussed hydrogen peroxide, indicating that it is very similar to peracetic acid, and is used as sanitizer and in food safety.
- **2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB).** The lead summarized the manufacture and uses of tocopherols. There was a list of ancillary substances included in the 2015 TR, which is included in this review document, along with some questions about additional ancillaries. A member noted that the NOSB is not currently reviewing ancillaries, however, the Subcommittees are keeping a list until the NOP determines how to move forward with the previous NOSB recommendation. The lead will make some edits based on comments from other members.
- **Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC).** The members discussed the current iteration of the proposal, and will continue the discussion on a call scheduled for tomorrow.
- **2021 Sunsets: Celery Powder.** The lead summarized the review and the members briefly discussed the celery powder panel that they will host at the Spring NOSB meeting. The lead added questions and will send them to the group for additional feedback before finalizing.
- **Celery powder panel logistics, facilitation, intros, etc. 4 panel members chosen.** The group briefly discussed questions for the panel.
- **Collagen Gel (casing)**. The draft review was circulated to the members and the lead summarized it. Collagen gel is similar to other casings on the list. Members suggested using the decision tree to determine the classification. The HS will continue the discussion and vote on collagen gel during the next call.
- **The meeting was adjourned**
-

[Previous HS Notes]

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

February 5, 2019

- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss
- Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC) - discuss proposal

February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal submission deadline.

- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss
- Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC) - discuss proposal
- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (ES) - discuss TR if available
- 2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB) - discuss

March 5, 2019

- Collagen Gel (casing) - Discuss proposal

March 19, 2019
April 2, 2019
April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar
May 7, 2019
May 21, 2019
June 4, 2019
June 18, 2019
July 2, 2019
July 16, 2019
August 6, 2019
August 20, 2019
September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Cont act**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Silver Dihydrogen Citrate Petition Addendum #1 Petition addendum #2	205.605(b)	TC/ SE	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 01 24 17. Response/request for TR due 03 28 17. Petition found sufficient 03 07 17. HS requested TR 03 07 14. TR in development. Petition addendum sent to HS 08 03 17. TR sent to HS 10 19 17/ Suff due 12 19 17. HS sent additional questions to TR contractor 12 05 17. TR under revision. Revised TR sent to HS 02 21 18. Response due 04 23 18. TR found sufficient 05 15 18. Petition addendum sent to HS 06 29 18.	02 20 19	Spr 2019
Pullulan	205.605(a)	LD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 02 27 18. Sufficiency due 04 30 18. Petition found suff 04 03 18. HS requested TR 04 03 18. TR sent to HS 09 12 18. Response due 11 12 18. TR found sufficient 10 02 18	11 20 18	Spr 2019
Collagen Gel (casing)	§205.606	AB	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 03 23 18. Petition Sufficiency due 5 22 18. Petition found sufficient 5 15 18. HS requested TR 5 15 18. TR in development. Expected Sep 2018. TR sent to HS 10 30 18. Response due 12 28 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor. Revised TR sent to HS 01 30 19. Response due 03 31 19. TR found sufficient 02 05 19	11 20 2018 01 29 2019 02 05 2019 02 20 2019	Spr 2019

2021 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"

Citric acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	“
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP See 2014 TR for microorganisms 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	“
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	ES	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec	01 29 19	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	ES	Y	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec. Revised TR due 03/2019	01 29 19	“
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	“
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“

Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	"
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	"
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. May not request TR, but hold panel instead.	02 19 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings TR	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 08 19 02 05 19	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD

Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Celery Powder panel	ALL	Discussed 02 05 19, 02 19 19	Spr 2019
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	Fall 2019

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, February 5, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB)), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Tom Chapman (TC) Steve Ela (SE); Eric Schwartz (ES); Scott Rice, (SR);
Absent: A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- 2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss
- Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC) - discuss proposal
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB).** The group approved the revisions to the draft review that were discussed on the December 18 call and will post it for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB).** The group approved the revisions to the draft review that were discussed on the December 18 call and will post it for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB).** The group approved the revisions to the draft review that were discussed on the December 18 call and will post it for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB).** The group approved the revisions to the draft review that were discussed on the December 18 call and will post it for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR).** The lead added additional language to the draft review and the group approved it for posting.
- **2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR).** The lead added additional language and the group approved the review document for posting.
- **2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR).** The lead added additional language and the group approved the review for posting.

- **2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR).** The lead added some additional language and the group approved the review for posting.
- **2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB).** The HS Chair presented the sunset review and the group also discussed the celery powder panel. The Chair reached out to several stakeholders and the group discussed a potential fourth panelist for the celery powder panel. The Chair will contact two potential experts in human health and will follow up with the NOP.
- **2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC).** The lead summarized the uses of the substance and the group discussed salts in general. The HS will post the review for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC).** The lead summarized the uses of the substance and the group discussed the questions for posting for public comment. Listed twice because we have a category for NVM (synthetic) and it is also listed as non-synthetic. Question pertains to use.
- **2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC).** The lead noted that the TR is from 1995. The lead summarized the materials' uses and added a question about NVM for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC).** The lead summarized the uses of the substance, and the group discussed modifications to the text and the questions for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC).** The lead summarized the review and the group discussed essentiality and international use, noting that it is used widely in many products.
- **2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC).** Deferred to next call.
- **Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items:** The lead indicated that the TR for collagen gel was found sufficient
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

January 29, 2019

Collagen gel proposal - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (ES) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (ES) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (ES) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (ES) - discuss

February 5, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss
Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC) - discuss proposal

February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal submission deadline.
    2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss
    Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC) - discuss proposal
    2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (ES) - discuss TR if available
    2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB) - discuss
    2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss
    2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB) - discuss
March 5, 2019
    Collagen Gel (casing) - Discuss proposal
March 19, 2019
April 2, 2019
April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar
May 7, 2019
May 21, 2019
June 4, 2019
June 18, 2019
July 2, 2019
July 16, 2019
August 6, 2019
August 20, 2019
September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Silver Dihydrogen Citrate Petition Addendum #1 Petition addendum #2	205.605(b)	TC/ SE	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 01 24 17. Response/request for TR due 03 28 17. Petition found sufficient 03 07 17. HS requested TR 03 07 14. TR in development. Petition addendum sent to HS 08 03 17. TR sent to HS 10 19 17/ Suff due 12 19 17. HS sent additional questions to TR contractor 12 05 17. TR under revision. Revised TR sent to HS 02 21 18. Response due 04 23 18. TR found sufficient 05 15 18. Petition addendum sent to HS 06 29 18.	02 19 19	Spr 2019

Pullulan	205.605(a)	LD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 02 27 18. Sufficiency due 04 30 18. Petition found suff 04 03 18. HS requested TR 04 03 18. TR sent to HS 09 12 18. Response due 11 12 18. TR found sufficient 10 02 18	11 20 18	Spr 2019
Collagen Gel (casing)	§205.606	AB	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 03 23 18. Petition Sufficiency due 5 22 18. Petition found sufficient 5 15 18. HS requested TR 5 15 18. TR in development. Expected Sep 2018. TR sent to HS 10 30 18. Response due 12 28 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor. Revised TR sent to HS 01 30 19. Response due 03 31 19.	11 20 2018 01 29 2019 03 05 2019	Spr 2019
2021 Sunsets **TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019**						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	"
Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP See 2014 TR for microorganisms 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	"
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	"
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	"
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	ES	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec	01 29 19	"
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"

Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	ES	Y	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec	01 29 19 02 19 19	“
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	“
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	“
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	“
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“

Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. May not request TR, but hold panel instead.	02 05 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings TR	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 08 19 02 05 19	"

Other projects

Name	Contact	Notes*	Target meeting
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD
Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Celery Powder panel	ALL	Discussed 02 05 19, 02 19 19	Spr 2019
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	Fall 2019

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. Proposals must be voted on by the NOSB, to become recommendations to the USDA. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy or regulations. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, January 29, 2019 1:00 pm ET

Present: Asa Bradman (AB)), Chair; Lisa de Lima (LD), Vice Chair; Harriet Behar (HB); Tom Chapman (TC) Steve Ela (SE); Eric Schwartz (ES)
Absent: Scott Rice, (SR); A-dae Briones (ARB)
Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Devon Pattillo (DP)

Agenda

- 2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (ES) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (ES) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (ES) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (ES) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (ES) - discuss
- Collagen gel proposal (AB) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss
- 2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (ES).** The lead summarized the substance and the members discussed the relationship of alginic acid to the Materials' Subcommittee discussion document on marine materials. A member asked about the sunset date, as alginic acid was reclassified (from nonsynthetic to synthetic) in a final rule published on December 27, 2018. It was previously renewed March 15, 2017 (82 FR 14420) with a sunset date of March 15, 2022. The NOP noted that the December 27, 2018 final rule should not affect sunset dates if the final rule changed only the annotation or classification of a substance that was already on the National List.
- **2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (ES).** The lead summarized the uses of citric acid noting that it is used widely in industry (75% of all citric acid is used in the food industry). The HS may add a question about organic sources.
- **2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (ES).** The lead summarized the substance and its uses and manufacture. The group discussed synthetic versus non-synthetic lactic acid and will add a question to the review for public comment.
- **2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (ES).** The NOP received the TR just prior to the shutdown on December 21, 2018 and will send it to the HS as soon as it is reviewed. The lead summarized the uses and manufacture of ascorbic acid, and noted that this is the main source of vitamin C.
- **2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (ES).** The lead summarized uses and manufacture of L-malic acid, the majority of which is produced through fermentation. The HS will add some questions to the review and post it for comment. The NOP received the TR just prior to the shutdown on December 21, 2018 and will send it to the HS as soon as it is reviewed.
- **Collagen gel (AB).** The lead will draft a document and the HS will schedule a discussion on a future call. NOP expects to deliver the revised TR to the HS by the end of this week.

- **Celery Powder panel.** The Handling Subcommittee along with the NOP selected several potential panelists to represent a broad cross section of the community. Ideally there will be four panelists with expertise in the following areas: producer/grower of organic celery, human health impacts of nitrates and nitrites, manufacturing of celery powder, and a handling representative who has knowledge of sourcing celery powder. The HS is seeking a human health expert who can speak to naturally derived vs. synthetically derived nitrates. AB is awaiting input from one other person and the HS will solidify the list by February 5.
- **2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC).** Deferred to next call due to lack of time
- **2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC).** Deferred to next call due to lack of time
- **2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC).** Deferred to next call due to lack of time
- **2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC).** Deferred to next call due to lack of time
- **2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC).** Deferred to next call due to lack of time
- **The meeting was adjourned**

Previous HS Notes

Future Call Schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 ET)

December 18, 2018

Celery powder panel discussion
2021 Sunsets: Calcium citrate (LD) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Potassium citrate (LD) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Sodium citrate (LD) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Calcium citrate (LD) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss

January 15, 2019 – cancelled due to shutdown

2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss

January 29, 2019

Collagen gel proposal - discuss/vote
2021 Sunsets: Citric acid (ES) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Lactic acid (ES) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Alginic acid (ES) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: L-Malic acid (ES) - discuss

February 5, 2019

2021 Sunsets: Gelatin (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Orange pulp, dried (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida) (ARB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Magnesium sulfate (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Perlite (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Activated charcoal (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SR) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Celery powder (AB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Calcium chloride (TC) - discuss

2021 Sunsets: Potassium iodide (TC) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Ferrous sulfate (TC) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Potassium phosphate (TC) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Fish Oil (TC) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: NVM (TC) - discuss
Silver Dihydrogen Citrate (SE/TC) - discuss proposal
Collagen gel proposal - discuss/vote

February 19, 2019 - Last call before proposal submission deadline.
2021 Sunsets: Ascorbic acid (ES) - discuss TR if available
2021 Sunsets: Peracetic acid (AB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Tocopherols (AB) - discuss
2021 Sunsets: Hydrogen peroxide (AB) - discuss
Silver Dihydrogen Citrate - discuss proposal

March 5, 2019
March 19, 2019
April 2, 2019
April 16, 2019 - No call. Public comment webinar
May 7, 2019
May 21, 2019
June 4, 2019
June 18, 2019
July 2, 2019
July 16, 2019
August 6, 2019
August 20, 2019
September 3, 2019
September 17, 2019
October 1, 2019
October 15, 2019
November 5, 2019
November 19, 2019
December 3, 2019
December 17, 2019

Work Agenda

Petitioned Substances						
Substance	**National List §**	**Contact**	**Doc type**	**Notes***	**Scheduled, Discussed, Voted**	**Target meeting**
Silver Dihydrogen Citrate Petition Addendum #1 Petition addendum #2	205.605(b)	TC/ SE	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 01 24 17. Response/request for TR due 03 28 17. Petition found sufficient 03 07 17. HS requested TR 03 07 14. TR in development. Petition addendum sent to HS 08 03 17. TR sent to HS 10 19 17/ Suff due 12 19 17. HS sent additional questions to TR contractor 12 05 17. TR under revision. Revised TR sent to HS 02 21 18. Response due 04 23 18. TR found sufficient 05 15 18. Petition addendum sent to HS 06 29 18.	02 05 19 02 19 19	Spr 2019
Pullulan	205.605(a)	LD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 02 27 18. Sufficiency due 04 30 18. Petition found suff 04 03 18. HS requested TR 04 03 18. TR sent to HS 09 12 18. Response due 11 12 18. TR found sufficient 10 02 18	11 20 18	Spr 2019
Collagen Gel (casing)	§205.606	AB	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 03 23 18. Petition Sufficiency due 5 22 18. Petition found sufficient 5 15 18. HS requested TR 5 15 18. TR in development. Expected Sep 2018. TR sent to HS 10 30 18. Response due 12 28 18. HS sent additional questions to contractor	11 20 2018 01 29 2019	Spr 2019

2021 Sunsets TR Requests: July 2018, Summary: Spr 2019, Review: Fall 2019						
Substance	**National List §**	**Con-tact**	**TR re-quest?**	**Notes**	**Scheduled, Discussed**	**Target meeting**
Alginic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 29 19	Summary: Spr 2019 Review: Fall 2019
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)	TC	N	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Citric acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	"

Dairy cultures	205.605(a)	SE	N	1995 TAP See 2014 TR for microorganisms 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Enzymes	205.605(a)	SE	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Lactic acid	205.605(a)	ES	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)	ES	Y	2003 TAP 2015 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec	02 19 19	“
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)	SR	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Microorganisms	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Perlite	205.605(a)	SR	N	1996 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)	TC	N	2011 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Yeast	205.605(a)	SE	N	2014 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 04 18	“
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)	SR	N	2002 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)	ES	Y	1995 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation. TR requested 08/21/18. TR due mid-Dec	01 29 19 02 19 19	“
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	“
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 Hydrogen Peroxide (Crops) 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	“
Peracetic acid	205.605(b)	AB	N	2016 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	“
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	“

Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)	TC	N	1995 TAP Phosphates TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)	SR	N	2001 TAP 2010 TR 2015 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)	LD	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18	"
Tocopherols	205.605(b)	AB	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 19 19	"
Celery powder	205.606	AB	Y	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18. May not request TR, but hold panel instead	02 05 19	"
Fish oil	205.606	TC	N	2015 TR 2017 NOSB Recommendation	02 05 19	"
Gelatin	205.606	ARB	Y	2002 TAP 2017 NOSB Recommendation HS requested TR 05 15 18 - combined with collagen gel and casings TR	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Orange pulp, dried	205.606	ARB	N	None 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	12 18 18 02 05 19	"
Seaweed, Wakame (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606	ARB	N	None. See TR for marine materials 2017 NOSB Recommendation	01 08 19 02 05 19	"

Other projects			
Name	**Contact**	**Notes***	**Target meeting**
Packaging substances used in organic food handling - including BPA	LD/AB	Submitted briefing paper to NOP 01 12 14. Response memo from NOP sent to HS 11 19 14. TR in development, expected mid-Sep - delayed. TR received 9/30/16. In review by the program. TR sent to HS 10 19 16. TR sufficiency due 12 20 16. TR found insufficient 12 20 16. Vote: 02 21 17. New TR in development. Expected July 2017. TR received 07 10 17. Response due 09 08 17. TR found sufficient 08 01 17. ON HOLD.	Discussion doc TBD

Nutrient Vitamins and Minerals - annotation change	TC	2011 NOSB recommendation DHA 2011 NOSB recommendation ARA Pending NOP Approval. Approved for addition to the work agenda 01 12 16. ON HOLD pending NOP action.	TBD
Celery Powder panel	ALL		Spr 2019
Research Priorities	TC/ALL	RPs due to MS Aug 2019	Fall 2019

*Highlight indicates committee action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote

Spring 2019 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Nov 26, 2018
NOSB – Spring 2019 proposals due to NOP	Feb 21, 2019
NOP - Draft Spring 2019 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Mar 4, 2019
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2019
Public comment closes	Apr 4, 2019
Discuss/finalize work agendas on ES call	Apr 13, 2019
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 8, 2019
Public comment webinars	Apr 16 & 18, 2019
Spring 2019 NOSB meeting - Seattle, WA	Apr 24 - 26, 2019